



**Legislative Assembly
Province of Alberta**

No. 20

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

Fourth Session

Twenty-Third Legislature

Tuesday, March 19, 1996

The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

Reading and Receiving Petitions

On request by Mr. Bruseker, Hon. Member for Calgary-North West, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government to support the continued provision of an affordable, high quality post-secondary education system.

On request by Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government to support the continued provision of an affordable, high quality post-secondary education system.

On request by Mr. Dalla-Longa, Hon. Member for Calgary-West, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government to support the continued provision of an affordable, high quality post-secondary education system.

Presenting Reports by Standing and Special Committees

Mr. Renner, Chairman, Select Standing Committee on Private Bills, presented the following report:

Mr. Speaker, in accordance with Standing Order 94, I have reviewed the petitions I presented yesterday and can advise the House that all but 1 of the petitions complies with Standing Orders 85 and 89.

The Select Standing Committee on Private Bills has considered the remaining petition and recommends to the Assembly that Standing Orders 89(1)(b) and 89(2) be waived for the petition for the Farmers' Union of Alberta Amendment Act, 1996.

I would ask for the Assembly's concurrence in the report.

The question being put, concurrence in the report was granted.

Notices of Motions

Mr. Bruseker, Hon. Member for Calgary-North West, gave oral notice of his intention to raise a purported point of privilege following Oral Question Period today.

Pursuant to Standing Order 34(2)(a), Hon. Mr. Day, Government House Leader, gave oral notice of the following Written Questions and Motions for Returns to be dealt with Wednesday, March 20, 1996:

Written Questions: Stand and retain their places.

Motion for Returns: M178.

Introduction of Bills (First Reading)

Notice having been given:

Bill 18 Energy Statutes Amendment Act, 1996 — Mr. Magnus

On motion by Hon. Mr. Day, Government House Leader, the following Bill was placed on the Order Paper under Government Bills and Orders:

Bill 18 Energy Statutes Amendment Act, 1996 — Mr. Magnus

Tabling Returns and Reports

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford:

Letter, undated, from Enid E. Green, Edmonton, to Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, regarding reductions in the Alberta Seniors Benefit
Sessional Paper 737/96

Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora:

Letter, undated, from Marsha Carnat, Calgary, to Hon. Mrs. McClellan, Minister of Health, regarding hospital cutbacks, with related newspaper articles attached
Sessional Paper 738/96

669 postcards addressed to Hon. Mrs. McClellan, Minister of Health, and 656 postcards addressed to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, regarding the five principles of Canada's Medicare system

Sessional Paper 739/96

Oral Question Period

During Oral Question Period, Hon. Mrs. McClellan, Minister of Health, filed the following:

Letter, dated March 19, 1996, from Dennis Magnusson, Chief Executive Officer, East Central Regional Health Authority, to Hon. Mrs. McClellan, Minister of Health, regarding the Hotel de Health and the lease/use of the Islay and Galahad health centres

Sessional Paper 740/96

Letter, dated March 19, 1996, from Hon. Mrs. McClellan, Minister of Health, to Hon. Mr. Dingwall, Federal Minister of Health, regarding the Hotel de Health proposal for the Islay and Galahad health centres

Sessional Paper 741/96

During Oral Question Period, Hon. Mr. Dinning, Provincial Treasurer, filed the following:

CBRS (Canadian Bond Rating Service) Credit News, dated March 18, 1996, regarding the upgrading of the long term ratings of the Province of Alberta to AA+ from AA

Sessional Paper 742/96

During Oral Question Period, Mr. Van Binsbergen, Hon. Member for West Yellowhead, filed the following:

Draft recommendations regarding Alberta's Forest Management Agreements, November 27, 1995

Sessional Paper 743/96

Members' Statements

Ms Abdurahman, Hon. Member for Clover Bar-Fort Saskatchewan, made a statement regarding a Legal Profession injunction against public adjusters dealings with uninsured third parties and suggesting changes to the Insurance Act or Law Society Act to solve the conflict.

Ms Haley, Hon. Member for Three Hills-Airdrie, made a statement regarding Airdrie schools' home lottery.

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, made a statement regarding the impact of cutbacks on seniors in general and on Enid Green of Edmonton in particular.

Privilege

Oral notice having been given earlier today, March 19, 1996, and pursuant to Standing Order 15(1) and (2), Mr. Bruseker, Hon. Member for Calgary-North West, raised a purported point of privilege regarding a letter received by Mr. Mitchell, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, regarding statements by the Leader of the Opposition and the possibility of court action.

Hon. Mr. Day, Government House Leader, and Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo, commented on the purported point of privilege.

The Speaker advised the Assembly he would take the matter under advisement.

Speakers' Statement — Point of Order, Hon. Member for Fort McMurray

Yesterday, March 18, 1996, the Hon. Member for Fort McMurray raised a point of order under Standing Order 23(h), (i) and (j) concerning comments made by both the Hon. Premier and the Hon. Minister of Transportation and Utilities in response to a question by the Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford concerning video lottery terminals. The Member complains about the characterization of the letters by the Minister and the Premier and insists that he was representing the interests of his constituents.

As Members are aware, this is the Chair's second ruling on the matter. On February 26, the Chair ruled that the Minister's characterization of the letter he received from the Member was not a point of order but rather a dispute about facts. At that time the Member clarified his position that the letter represented the views of his constituents and not his own views. The Member has again made that point quite clear.

The Hon. Member also questions the propriety of the Minister referring to the letter in the Assembly. On this point, the Chair refers Members to paragraph 495(7) of Beaudesne, which states that:

When a letter, even though it may have been written originally as a private letter, becomes part of a record of a department, it becomes a public document, and if quoted by a Minister in debate, must be tabled on request.

A similar issue arose in the House of Commons last year when a Minister quoted from a letter sent by a Member on behalf of his constituents. The Speaker held there was no question of privilege and relied upon the same paragraph of Beauchesne. Members may wish to refer to the House of Commons Hansard for February 16, 1995 at pages 9734-5.

Although there is no point of order, the Chair wishes to remind all Members that one of the ways a Member can best serve his or her constituents is by writing letters to Ministers on their behalf. Of course, in certain situations, there may be statutory restrictions on releasing the information but it is not the role of the Chair to comment on that issue. As a consequence, the Chair would ask all Members to consider what the impact may be upon a Member's ability to serve his or her constituents before referring to correspondence from another Member in the Assembly.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Public Bills and Orders Other Than Government Bills and Orders

Second Reading

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time and referred to Committee of the Whole:

Bill 207 Conflicts of Interest Amendment Act, 1996 — Mr. Bruseker.

A debate followed.

The question being put, the motion was defeated. The names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 20

Abdurahman	Henry	Sapers
Bracko	Hewes	Sekulic
Bruseker	Kirkland	Soetaert
Carlson	Leibovici	Van Binsbergen
Collingwood	Massey	White
Dalla-Longa	Nicol	Zwozdesky
Hanson	Percy	

Against the motion: 41

Ady	Fritz	Paszkowski
Beniuk	Gordon	Pham
Black	Haley	Renner
Brassard	Havelock	Rostad
Burgener	Herard	Severtson
Calahasen	Hierath	Shariff
Cardinal	Hlady	Smith
Clegg	Jacques	Stelmach
Coutts	Kowalski	Tannas
Day	Langevin	Taylor
Dinning	Magnus	Thurber
Doerksen	McClellan	Woloshyn
Fischer	McFarland	Yankowsky
Forsyth	Oberg	

Motions Other Than Government Motions

504. Moved by Dr. Massey on behalf of Mr. Mitchell :

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly urge the Government to recognize that effective government must meet the tests of integrity, fiscal responsibility and community building based on shared values in Alberta.

A debate followed.

Pursuant to Standing Order 8(4), the question being put, the motion was defeated.

505. Moved by Mr. Henry:

Be it resolved that the Legislative Assembly urge the Government to ensure equal access to quality education for Alberta children by providing for: disabled children; special needs children; early childhood services; English as a second language for each child whose mother tongue is not English, regardless of the student's place of birth; a wide variety of core and optional subjects; the incremental elimination of all user and transportation fees; and access to computers for all students.

A debate followed.

Pursuant to Standing Order 8(2)(c), debate adjourned, Mrs. Soetaert speaking.

Government Bills and Orders

Second Reading

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time and referred to Committee of the Whole:

Bill 15 Hospitals Amendment Act, 1996 — Mr. Renner

A debate followed.

Mr. Dickson moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

The following Bill was read a Second time and referred to Committee of the Whole:

Bill 14 Health Foundations Act — Hon. Mrs. McClellan

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mrs. Black, Deputy Government House Leader, that it be called 5:30 p.m., at 5:23 p.m. the Assembly adjourned until 8:00 p.m.

TUESDAY, MARCH 19, 1996 — 8:00 P.M.

Royal Assent

His Honour the Honourable the Lieutenant Governor, having entered the Assembly and being seated on the Throne,

The Speaker addressed His Honour in the following words:

May it please your Honour:

The Legislative Assembly has, at its present sitting, passed certain Bills to which, and in the name of the Legislative Assembly, I respectfully request Your Honour's assent.

The Clerk of the Assembly then read the titles of the Bills that had been passed as follows:

- 10 Appropriation (Supplementary Supply) Act, 1996
- 11 Appropriation (Interim Supply) Act, 1996

To these Bills, Royal Assent was announced by the Clerk of the Legislative Assembly in the following words:

In Her Majesty's name, His Honour the Honourable the Lieutenant Governor doth assent to these Bills.

His Honour the Honourable the Lieutenant Governor then retired from the Assembly.

Committee of Supply (Days 18 — Main Estimates)

According to order, the Assembly resolved itself into Committee of Supply, and the Speaker left the Chair.

(Assembly in Committee)

And after some time spent therein, the Acting Speaker resumed the Chair and Mr. Tannas reported as follows:

Mr. Speaker:

The Committee of Supply has had under consideration certain resolutions (reported from the Designated Supply Subcommittee), reports as follows and requests leave to sit again:

Resolved that a sum not exceeding the following be granted to Her Majesty for the fiscal year ending March 31, 1997, for the Department and purposes indicated:

Economic Development and Tourism

\$66,275,000	Operating Expenditure
<u>315,000</u>	Capital Investment
66,590,000	

The Committee of Supply has also had under consideration certain resolutions (reported from the Subcommittees of Committee of Supply) of the Departments of Public Works, Supply and Services; and Federal and Intergovernmental Affairs, reports progress thereon and requests leave to sit again.

Mr. Speaker, I would like to table copies of a document tabled by Hon. Mr. Fischer, Minister of Public Works, Supply and Services, during Committee of Supply consideration of the Estimates of the Department of Public Works, Supply and Services:

Responses to Questions Raised on March 11, 1996, Alberta Public Works, Supply and Services, 1996-97 Committee of Supply Debate, Subcommittee C, March 19, 1996

Sessional Paper 744/96

The question being put, the report and the request for leave to sit again were agreed to.

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Evans, Deputy Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 10:20 p.m. until Wednesday, March 20, 1996, at 1:30 p.m.

Title: Tuesday, March 19, 1996